

**CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, CHICO**  
**ANNUAL PROGRAM ASSESSMENT REPORT**

Date: 27 September 2021

**I. Assessment of Student Learning Outcomes**

**1. Program Name and Contact Information of Program Assessment Coordinator:**

Computer Animation and Game Development, Clarke Steinback (csteinback@csuchico.edu)

**2. Student Learning Outcomes**

1. Recognize and evaluate critical and aesthetic issues within computer graphics and the mixed media. (Issues)
2. Apply aesthetic judgments and critical thinking skills to art and graphics related issues. (Aesthetics)
3. Demonstrate mastery of specific technical, conceptual and critical abilities within computer graphics and the mixed media. (Abilities)
4. Demonstrate proficiency with industrial applications to visual communication related technologies. (Proficiency)
5. Communicate effectively in written format on research and creative issues. (Written)
6. Communicate effectively in oral format on research and creative issues. (Oral)
7. Apply critical thinking and aesthetic judgments in critiquing mixed media and computer graphics productions. (Critiquing)
8. Function on multi-disciplinary teams. (Teams)
9. Work collaboratively and individually with an understanding of the production process utilized in industry-standard studios. (Process)
10. Demonstrate professionalism through creative and intellectual independence. (Professionalism)

**3. Course Alignment Matrix:**

**Mapping CAGD Courses to Program Outcomes**

		Program Outcome									
		Issues	Aesthetic	Abilities	Proficiency	Written	Oral	Critiquing	Teams	Process	Professionalism
Course Title	Course	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Computer-Assisted Art	110	I	I	I	I	I				I	
Digital Photography	112	I	P	P	P	I		I		I	I
Digital Modeling	230	I	P	P	P	P	P	I		I	I
Digital Animation	240	I	P	P	P		P	I		I	
Digital Texturing	320		P	P		P	P	P		P	P
3-D Computer Modeling	330	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	I
3-D Character Modeling	331	P	P	P	P	P	P	P		P	P
Computer Animation	340	P	P	P	D			P		P	P
Advanced Animation Pre-Prod	345	P	P	P	P	D	D	D	P	P	P
3D Scanning	350	P		P	P					P	P
Game Asset Production	373	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	I
Digital Lighting and Texturing	420		D	D						D	
3-D Character Animation	441	P	P	P	P		P	P		P	P
Senior Portfolio	493	D	D	D	D	D	D	D		D	D
Advanced Animation Post-Prod	545	D	D	D	D		D	D	D	D	D

I = Introduced, P = Practiced with Feedback, D = Demonstrated at the Mastery Level

Assessed AY 2020-2021

#### 4. What is your current Assessment Plan

All Program Outcomes, except #1 Issues and #8 Teams, assessed in this cycle using embedded assessments. With use of the embedded assessment the Program intends to continue to assess all Program Outcomes. The Program continues to expand the courses in which embedded assessment data is collected to include more courses over the next few assessment cycles. In the past, the Program has used the ECC Senior Exit Survey to review 'Satisfaction' and 'Preparedness' that can speak to overall trends, however the pandemic and resulting stress on students and faculty as well as the change to online instruction, produced low completion rates and the surveys were not used this academic year.

#### 5. Learning Outcome(s) Assessed in AY 2020-2021:

- 2 Aesthetics
- 3 Abilities
- 4 Proficiency
- 5 Written
- 6 Oral
- 7 Critiquing
- 9 Process
- 10 Professionalism

#### 6. Assessment Methodology Used:

For most courses currently providing assessment data, grading rubrics for assignments have rubric elements associated with Program Outcomes. Thus, most courses have many grading elements which service as embedded assessment. Embedded assessments were used in assignments for all courses submitting assessment data. CAGD 110, 112, 230 and 345 are core CAGD courses for the entire Program; CAGD 240, 493 and 545 are required in the Animation Production Option; CAGD 320 and 373 are required in the Game Development Option and are electives in the Animation Production Option; CAGD 330, 331 and 420 are upper-division electives for the students graduating in this cycle. All assessed projects and assignments in these courses have rubrics associated with each element in the rubric linking back to a Program Outcome. For assessment, the rubrics utilized a three (3) point scale – 0, 1, 2 or 3 for evaluating each element in the rubric.

The Program has a shared assessment rubric library which is continuously enhanced and updated. Rubrics are used in grading and in some cases for peer evaluation used for presentations and project critiques. The peer evaluation using the assessment rubrics provides additional assessment data beyond that given by the instructor, teaching associates and graders.

The types of assignments used in the assessment include blog postings, critiques, presentations, papers, assignments, and significant course projects. The grading, and thus, assessment rubrics are published for the students as tools to assist in helping understand assignments and expectation. All rubrics are detailed and phrase-based, using an underlying scale of zero (0) to three (3) reflecting unacceptable to exceptional for assessment. Currently the Program has set a benchmark of 70% of students achieving acceptable and exceptional for the aggregated data for each Program Outcome.

The use of the embedded assessment provides the program with extensive input as to performance on each of the evaluated Program Outcomes for AY 2020-2021; the embedded assessments also reduces the burden on the faculty in that grading with the rubrics provides assessment data collected in Blackboard Learn that the faculty can then export for the assessment coordinator to use for the Program.

#### 7. Assessment Results:

Please describe/report outcomes of assessment. How well did students perform on the assessment task? Feel free to use the table below to report results, adapting the table as necessary, or provide narrative describing the assessment results.

In Academic Year 2020 – 2021, eight (8) of the ten (10) Program Outcomes were assessed in 15 different courses in the Program from each academic level – freshman, sophomore, junior and senior. Appendix A provides a summary of the results from the embedded rubrics for each course in which the rubric was used for AY 2020 – 2021. The Program Outcomes for Issues (#1) and Teams (#8) were not measured in this assessment cycle. The assessment of each measured Program Outcome is derived from rubrics embedded in grading and critiquing assignments in each assessed course. The aggregate assessment outcome averages (See Table 7.1) indicate that the percentage of students achieving the target value of 2.0 was more than 70% in all eight (8) measured Program Outcomes with the Program goal being 70%. All measured Program Outcomes averaged above 79% of the students achieving the target value in the aggregated data. The average target goal for each Program Outcome was 2.0 and the aggregate assessment data indicates that the Program achieved this goal in all eight (8) measured Program Outcomes. All the results displayed in the table are from embedded assessment rubrics associated with assignments in a mixture of Program core, Option-required and CAGD upper-division elective courses. Results for each rubric element in each course are listed in Appendix A with rubric elements used in the assessment tools listed in Appendix B.

Table 7.1 – AY 2020 – 2021 Program Outcome Assessment Aggregates

Student Learning Outcome	Sample and Sample Size	Measure	Average – Scale 0 – 3 Target 2	Percent of Students Achieving Target
2 Aesthetics	3,674	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.3	87.45%
3 Abilities	3,015	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.4	87.93%
4 Proficiency	519	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.2	83.21%
5 Written	699	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.7	96.74%
6 Oral	126	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.7	99.38%
7 Critiquing	94	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.2	79.17%
9 Process	2,612	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.6	92.12%
10 Professionalism	596	Embedded course rubrics in course assignments.	2.7	95.95%

The comparison of the aggregate averages between AY 2019 – 2020 and AY 2020 – 2021 (See Table 7.2) shows mostly minor fluctuation in average target values for each of the measured Program Outcomes with an observed decline in Outcome #7 Critiquing which also shows a decline in sample size. The Percentage of Students Achieving Targets does also show some variation between the two years with all the current year’s percentages at or above the target of 70%.

Table 7.2 – Comparison AY 2019 – 2020 and AY 2020 – 2021

Student Learning Outcome	AY 2019 - 2020			AY 2020 - 2021			Change	
	Sample and Sample Size	Average – Scale 0 – 3 Target 2	Percent of Students Achieving Target	Sample and Sample Size	Average – Scale 0 – 3 Target 2	Percent of Students Achieving Target	Average	Percent of Students Achieving Target
2 Aesthetics	5,596	2.3	88.54%	3,674	2.3	87.45%	0.0	-1.09%
3 Abilities	3,453	2.3	82.78%	3,015	2.4	87.93%	0.2	5.15%
4 Proficiency	755	2.3	83.70%	519	2.2	83.21%	-0.1	-0.49%
5 Written	890	2.8	94.58%	699	2.7	96.74%	0.0	2.16%
6 Oral	622	2.5	96.33%	126	2.7	99.38%	0.2	3.05%
7 Critiquing	545	2.6	92.28%	94	2.2	79.17%	-0.4	-13.12%
9 Process	3,886	2.6	91.27%	2,612	2.6	92.12%	0.0	0.85%
10 Professionalism	1,036	2.6	91.73%	596	2.7	95.95%	0.1	4.21%

## 8. Analysis / Interpretation / Dissemination of Results

How do the assessment data you have collected and evaluated inform the program or department's understanding of student learning? How were the results shared with the following stakeholders: faculty, students, campus stakeholders, external stakeholders, other?

Overall, the aggregate assessment results demonstrate the achievement of the Program Outcomes within the courses and assignments assessed. The aggregated averages for each of the measured outcomes achieved the target of 2.0 or higher on the 3-point scale for all measured outcomes. Using the objective of 70% of the students achieving the targeted 2.0-level, each of the measured Program Outcomes achieved this goal. These aggregate assessment results show the Program as a whole achieving the targets and goals for the eight (8) measured Program Outcomes.

Although Program Outcome #7 Critiquing exceeded the target of 70% of students achieving 2.0 or higher in AY 2020 – 2021 there was an observed decline between AY 2019 – 2020 and AY 2020 – 2021. This decline may be in part due to the smaller sample size in this assessment period. The change may also be due to a change in courses sampled in AY 2020 – 2021 from AY 2019 – 2020.

The embedded assessment data shows the Program attaining the assessment goals with the embedded rubrics. The bulk of the instruction and assessment does rely on under-paid part-time faculty who are dedicated to the success of the students and Program. Maintaining motivation for these lecturers continues to be a challenge in the current environment. The Faculty's investment and buy-in to the Program and assessment are critical, and the faculty and Program need to be valued to assist in not only assessment but also the continued quality of teaching and student success.

Overall, the results of the embedded Program Outcome assessment data show the Program is meeting the targets and goals.

The results of the assessment are distributed to and discussed with the faculty in faculty meetings. Other stakeholders (students, alumni and employers) will be provided the data through web publications.

## 9. Closing the Loop: Planned Program Improvement Actions

How will the assessment data and their evaluation be used to improve and/or maintain the program? Address items a, b, c, d and/or e only if they apply to this report cycle, not all items would necessarily be addressed.

### a) Planned curriculum changes for improved learning outcomes.

For example, revising pedagogy, courses, assignments, curricula, or other learning support mechanisms.

No change in the curriculum is planned or anticipated due to the embedded assessment results other than streamlining the options within the Major. Ongoing updates to the curriculum and pedagogy are expected to continue broadening the use of high-impact practices, flipping the classroom, endeavoring to update high DFW-rate courses and addressing the need for additional sections to accommodate the growing student population.

### b) Planned Revision of Measures or Metrics (if applicable)

A possible revision of a measure might be to recommend a change in the assignments that are evaluated for program assessment, or the number of assignments examined, and by whom. A metric revision might be for program faculty to decide to change the "bar" for acceptable performance.

The Program Curriculum Committee will continue to review the Course to Program Outcome Matrix and will consider updating the Program's Learning Outcomes for courses, especially in light of the update to the 2021-2022 catalog. Also, the articulation of the outcomes between courses in prerequisite chains will be reviewed in an effort to maintain cohesion within the Program. The Program Curriculum Committee

will hold additional rubric workshops to assist faculty in understanding and developing effective rubrics as well as consolidating similar rubrics to provide consistency for students throughout the Program. The faculty will discuss means to increase the completion of senior surveys, and expand our initial outreach to industry for feedback.

**c) Planned Revisions to Program Objectives or Learning Outcomes (if applicable)**

After examining the assessment data it might be appropriate to revise one or more of the Program Objectives or Student Learning Outcomes.

No change in the currently measured Program Outcomes is planned or anticipated.

**d) Changes to Assessment Schedule (if applicable)**

Do the results create a need for change in your assessment schedule? If so, please describe.

No change in the assessment schedule is planned or anticipated.

**e) No Change Being Made**

Indicate why the results do not call for more change at this time (for example, results indicate Benchmark is being met or exceeded). If results do not compel change or the change necessary cannot be made at this time, or other circumstance, please explain.

Although continued evolution of the assessment along with looking at the coupling of outcomes between courses in the Program, no change in the assessment plan or schedule are anticipated.

**10. Information for Next Year**

What learning outcome(s) are you examining next year and who will be the contact person?

The Program anticipates surveying via embedded assessments in the next academic year for each of the ten (10) Program Outcomes:

- 1 Issues
- 2 Aesthetics
- 3 Abilities
- 4 Proficiency
- 5 Written
- 6 Oral
- 7 Critiquing
- 8 Teams
- 9 Process
- 10 Professionalism

Clarke Steinback, the only tenured faculty in the Program, will again be charged with collecting and assembling the assessment data, and thus he will continue to be the contact person for assessment.

**II. Appendices (please include any of the following that are applicable to your program)**

**A. Assessment Data Summaries (Details that elaborate on item 6, above.)**

**Data Summaries for embedded rubrics**

Course	PO	Element	Average	STD	N	Percent of Students Achieving	
CAGD	110	2	Animation	2.1	0.78	192	83.3%
CAGD	345	2	Camera Shot, Angles, and Movement	2.2	0.50	26	96.2%
CAGD	110	2	Color/Value	2.1	0.74	369	79.9%
CAGD	110	2	Composition	2.2	0.71	187	84.5%
CAGD	545	2	Composition	1.9	0.45	29	86.2%
CAGD	331	2	Concept Design	2.8	0.39	37	100.0%
CAGD	230	2	Critical Thinking - Aesthetics and Creativity	2.7	0.61	39	92.3%
CAGD	330	2	Critical Thinking - Aesthetics and Creativity	2.4	0.66	31	90.3%
CAGD	112	2	Exposure	2.7	0.61	88	94.3%
CAGD	240	2	Key Poses	1.9	0.80	95	68.4%
CAGD	441	2	Key Poses	2.4	0.67	50	94.0%
CAGD	112	2	Lighting and Exposure	2.4	0.69	254	90.2%
CAGD	545	2	Motion Timing	1.7	0.75	90	71.1%
CAGD	373	2	Organization and Presentation	2.5	0.50	22	100.0%
CAGD	441	2	Personality	2.2	0.68	53	83.0%
CAGD	441	2	Poses	2.1	0.73	53	83.0%
CAGD	545	2	Poses Dynamic	1.4	0.94	31	54.8%
CAGD	112	2	Posing -Expression and Body Language	2.7	0.60	85	95.3%
CAGD	110	2	Quality	2.1	0.66	370	84.3%
CAGD	230	2	Rendering	2.8	0.46	39	97.4%
CAGD	330	2	Rendering	2.3	0.70	87	86.2%
CAGD	331	2	Rendering	2.1	0.31	19	100.0%
CAGD	112	2	Source Images	2.5	0.78	85	89.4%
CAGD	240	2	Staging	2.4	0.80	190	82.6%
CAGD	441	2	Staging	2.5	0.61	68	94.1%
CAGD	110	2	Story	2.3	0.67	189	90.5%
CAGD	345	2	Story	2.2	0.62	29	96.6%
CAGD	110	2	Texture	2.1	0.77	371	82.7%
CAGD	230	2	Texturing	2.5	0.65	82	91.5%
CAGD	320	2	Texturing	1.9	0.90	67	74.6%
CAGD	330	2	Texturing	2.6	0.65	88	93.2%
CAGD	373	2	Texturing	2.2	0.98	22	86.4%

<b>CAGD</b>	240	2	Timing/Spacing	1.9	0.83	68	67.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	2	Virtual Sculpting	2.4	0.55	31	96.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	2	Virtual Sculpting	2.3	0.57	19	94.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	545	2	Visual Reference	2.3	0.82	31	90.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	2	Visually Compelling/Composition	2.3	0.69	88	89.8%
<b>2 Aesthetics Average</b>				2.3	0.67	3,674	87.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	545	3	Animation Principles	1.7	0.92	59	67.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	240	3	Appeal	1.9	0.82	47	59.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	441	3	Appeal	2.1	0.75	32	75.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	3	Blending Images Together	2.3	0.69	85	87.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	3	Digital Darkroom	2.4	0.74	343	88.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Edge Loops	2.4	0.58	19	94.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Form and Proportions	2.8	0.48	77	97.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	3	Form and Proportions	2.9	0.31	9	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	3	Lighting	2.5	0.63	93	94.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	3	Lighting	2.4	0.83	67	89.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	3	Lighting	2.6	0.60	87	96.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Lighting	2.4	0.48	19	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	3	Lighting	2.9	0.31	9	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	3	Lighting	2.6	0.77	29	89.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	3	Low-Poly Modeling	2.5	0.67	31	96.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	3	Map Baking	2.7	0.62	87	94.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	3	Merging Images	2.4	0.91	86	84.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	3	Modeling & Overall Geometry	2.4	0.76	93	87.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	3	Modeling & Overall Geometry	2.4	0.70	45	91.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Overall Geometry	2.4	0.95	39	76.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	3	Overall Geometry	2.7	0.60	51	96.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	3	Overall Geometry	2.7	0.58	18	94.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	3	Polygon Limit	2.9	0.35	31	96.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Polygon Limit	3.0	-	39	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	3	Polygon Limit	2.9	0.50	51	96.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	3	Polygon Limit	2.8	0.69	18	94.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Polypainting	2.4	0.74	19	94.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	240	3	Principles of Animation	1.7	0.79	76	57.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	340	3	Principles of Animation	1.6	0.78	99	44.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	441	3	Principles of Animation	1.6	0.68	18	55.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	3	Project Guidelines	2.8	0.48	428	96.3%

<b>CAGD</b>	230	3	Scene Interaction	2.5	1.00	8	87.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	3	Scene Interaction	2.3	1.15	23	78.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	3	Shader Networks	2.8	0.46	87	98.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Shader Networks	2.9	0.31	19	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	3	Shader Networks	2.6	0.88	11	90.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	3	Storyboard Language	2.6	0.69	26	88.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	3	Texture Creation and Baking	2.2	0.93	23	82.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Textures	2.3	0.71	39	89.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	3	Textures Maps	2.4	0.74	51	88.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	3	Textures Maps	2.6	0.96	18	88.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	110	3	Translation	2.1	0.76	179	81.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Uniform Spaced Geometry	2.2	0.61	19	89.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	Use of Topology	2.7	0.45	18	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	3	UV Mapping	2.1	0.73	93	87.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	3	UV Mapping	2.0	0.70	67	80.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	3	UV Mapping	2.8	0.56	39	97.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	3	UV Mapping	2.8	0.58	51	92.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	3	UV Mapping	1.8	0.65	22	77.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	3	UV Mapping	2.9	0.31	18	100.0%
<b>3 Abilities Average</b>				2.4	0.66	3,015	87.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	545	4	Narrative Conveyance	1.9	0.72	59	79.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	4	Storytelling	2.2	0.66	83	86.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	4	Unity Scene Construction & Interaction	1.8	1.02	45	62.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	4	UV Layout, Organization, and Atlasing	2.1	0.88	23	73.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	4	Visual Continuity	2.9	0.32	26	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	4	Visually Communicates Story	2.4	0.68	26	88.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	4	Visually Compelling	2.4	0.67	257	91.4%
<b>4 Proficiency Average</b>				2.2	0.71	519	83.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Analysis quality	2.9	0.30	29	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Beat Sheet	2.0	0.87	29	82.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Blog Content	2.9	0.26	28	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Content quantity	2.9	0.36	29	96.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Formatting & Grammar	2.7	0.52	29	96.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Formatting, Grammar & Spelling	2.6	0.56	29	96.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	5	Reflective Commentary/Analysis	2.8	0.43	84	97.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	5	Reflective Commentary/Analysis	2.8	0.58	34	97.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	5	Reflective Commentary/Analysis	3.0	-	2	100.0%



<b>CAGD</b>	373	5	Reflective Commentary/Analysis	2.6	0.57	22	95.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Story Development	2.8	0.39	26	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	5	Title, Genre, Logline	2.7	0.66	29	96.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	5	Write-up	2.5	0.76	168	90.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	5	Write-up	2.7	0.55	19	94.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	5	Writing Conventions: Formatting, Grammar, and Spelling	2.9	0.29	84	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	5	Writing Conventions: Formatting, Grammar, and Spelling	2.9	0.51	34	97.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	5	Writing Conventions: Formatting, Grammar, and Spelling	3.0	-	2	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	5	Writing Conventions: Formatting, Grammar, and Spelling	2.2	0.39	22	100.0%
<b>5 Written Average</b>				2.7	0.45	699	96.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	6	Body language	2.0	-	8	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	6	Hesitations, other voice habits	2.8	0.51	20	95.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	6	Maintaining eye contact	3.0	-	8	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	6	Maintaining eye contact	3.0	-	20	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	6	Poise	2.3	0.43	8	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	6	Poise	3.0	-	20	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	6	Voice volume, enunciation & speed	3.0	-	20	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	6	Voice Volume, Enunciation & Speed	2.8	0.42	22	100.0%
<b>6 Oral Average</b>				2.7	0.17	126	99.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	7	Commentary	2.0	1.10	28	75.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	7	Critical Thinking - Composition, Content, and Aesthetics	2.3	0.89	66	83.3%
<b>7 Critiquing Average</b>				2.2	0.99	94	79.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	9	Camera & Rendering	2.3	0.56	64	95.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	9	Camera & Rendering	2.4	0.76	18	94.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	493	9	Camera & Rendering	2.7	0.47	9	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	9	Camera, Lighting, & Rendering	2.5	0.62	57	96.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	9	Critique Completion	2.3	1.16	28	78.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	9	File Structure	2.8	0.50	258	96.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	9	File Structure & Formats	2.5	0.62	45	93.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	9	File Structure & Layer Organization	2.9	0.38	171	97.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	9	File Structure and Formats	2.6	0.74	93	89.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	9	File Structure and Formats	2.6	0.58	67	95.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	9	File Structures and Formats	2.8	0.67	88	94.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	9	File Structures and Formats	2.9	0.48	76	94.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	9	File Structures and Formats	2.9	0.42	64	95.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	9	File Structures and Formats	2.8	0.63	18	88.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	493	9	File Structures and Formats	2.8	0.63	9	88.9%

<b>CAGD</b>	110	9	File Submission	2.8	0.59	369	93.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	240	9	File Submission	2.7	0.62	98	92.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	9	Model Export and Import	2.9	0.33	8	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	420	9	Quality of Work	2.4	0.77	11	81.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	493	9	Quality of Work	2.4	0.60	45	97.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	9	Scene and Shot Numbers	2.6	0.74	26	92.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	9	Scene Organization	2.6	0.62	93	94.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	9	Scene Organization	2.4	0.63	67	92.5%
<b>CAGD</b>	330	9	Scene Organization	2.9	0.45	88	97.7%
<b>CAGD</b>	331	9	Scene Organization	2.9	0.42	76	97.4%
<b>CAGD</b>	350	9	Scene Organization	3.0	-	28	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	9	Scene Organization	2.3	0.69	45	91.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	345	9	Script Execution and Formatting	2.7	0.54	26	96.2%
<b>CAGD</b>	110	9	Task Management	2.2	0.85	192	76.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	240	9	Task Management	2.0	0.82	97	68.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	9	Unity Importation	2.6	0.82	23	87.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	9	Web Gallery	2.6	0.84	255	90.2%
<b>9 Process Average</b>				2.6	0.61	2,612	92.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	545	10	Compilation	1.5	0.76	31	61.3%
<b>CAGD</b>	493	10	Content - Professional	2.2	0.69	45	88.9%
<b>CAGD</b>	493	10	Organization - Professional	2.7	0.51	45	97.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	10	Professionalism - Blog Post	2.6	0.49	22	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	10	Professionalism - ePortfolio	3.0	-	84	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	10	Professionalism - ePortfolio	2.9	0.55	34	97.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	10	Professionalism - ePortfolio	3.0	-	2	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	10	Slideshow	3.0	-	8	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	10	Slideshow	3.0	-	20	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	10	Usability and Accessibility: Site Navigation, Text Elements, Layout, and Color	2.8	0.45	83	98.8%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	10	Usability and Accessibility: Site Navigation, Text Elements, Layout, and Color	2.8	0.60	34	97.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	10	Usability and Accessibility: Site Navigation, Text Elements, Layout, and Color	3.0	-	2	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	112	10	Visual Communication	2.8	0.43	83	97.6%
<b>CAGD</b>	230	10	Visual Communication	2.6	0.65	34	97.1%
<b>CAGD</b>	320	10	Visual Communication	3.0	-	2	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	373	10	Visual Communication	2.5	0.50	22	100.0%
<b>CAGD</b>	493	10	Work Ethic	2.6	0.58	45	95.6%
<b>10 Professionalism Average</b>				2.7	0.36	596	95.9%
<b>Grand Average</b>				2.5	0.58	11,335	90.6%

## B. Measurement Instruments (Rubrics, Surveys, etc.)

### Embedded Rubric Elements

Outcome #2

Apply aesthetic judgments and critical thinking skills to art and graphics related issues. (Aesthetic)

PLO	Attributes	Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
		Value	0	1	2	3	
2	Animation	Does the animation in the image help support the story being told?	Animation is difficult to understand or does not seem to support the image's narrative in any way.	Animation is relative to the subject matter but still needs to be explored for readability.	Animation is clearly readable and is used wisely to enhance the image and story.	Animation is used creatively and courageously marking a successfully entertaining narrative	110
2	Camera Shot, Angles, and Movement	Were the chosen camera shot, angle and movement (if necessary) effective to communicate the story.	Chosen camera elements are unacceptable to communicate the story effectively, lacking dynamic visualization.	Camera elements chosen are not dynamic and poorly communicate the story needing significant improvement.	Chosen camera elements are acceptable but could use improvement.	Camera elements chosen communicate the story well, establishing story structure, continuity, and visual effectiveness.	345
2	Color/Value	Is their enough variety of color and value in your image to create a feeling of dimensionality?	Color is applied thoughtlessly, flat, and/or is distracting from the image.	Color is explored but may seem minimal, blotchy or distracting.	Color enhances dimensionality and readability of the scene with little to no issues.	Color application is clear and intuitive, successfully enhancing illusion as well as mood.	110
2	Composition	Did the student utilize composition principles to create the scene?	Little to no consideration for determining an appropriate composition for the scene.	Seemingly aware of the arrangement of subject matter within image.	Placement of subject matter and camera supports the overall composition of the scene.	Placement of subject matter and camera clearly and effectively supports the construct of the scene as well as energizes the conceptual meaning.	110 545
2	Concept Design	Did the student utilize concept design appropriately for the 3D model?	Little to no consideration for determining an appropriate design of the 3D model.	Followed the basic concept design for the 3D model. ( Followed tutorial only)	Followed the basic concept design with some unique design characteristics for the 3d model.	Used a unique or Exceptional concept design to facilitate a 3D model.	331
2	Critical Thinking - Aesthetics and Creativity	Are all models in the scene appropriate for the concept and arranged in Unity to demonstrate cohesiveness and a communicated meaning and composition?	Little to no consideration for determining an appropriate composition for the scene. The scene did not effectively communicate a story and is unsupportive of the chosen game concept.	Scene composition minimally communicates a story and a likeness to the game concept and contains several inconsistencies/errors along with little relative proportionality and artistic concept, creating an environment that is minimally cohesive.	Scene composition communicates an effective color scheme, story and a likeness to the game concept with most buildings in the scene being proportional and following the same artistic concept with few inconsistencies.	Scene composition communicates a story and a likeness to the game concept with all buildings exhibiting proportionality, following the same artistic concept and are arranged to create a cohesive environment fitting with the overall game concept.	230 330

2	Exposure	Did students consider and utilize value appropriately for their subject matter?	Did not take value into consideration.	Value implemented incorrectly or value should have been utilized better.	Value was considered and implemented appropriately.	Superior - careful attention to detail, value well executed.	112
2	Key Poses	Secondary action animation was applied to the mocap for the character.	No secondary action in the character. Hands and head are in default poses. Limbs move into the body, needed to add animation layers to help add offsets.	Poor secondary action in the character. Head and hands are in default pose in some clips. Limbs move into the body, needed to add animation layers to help add offsets.	Good secondary action in character. Head and hands have good animation in most clips but need further refinement. Good timing for the head or/ hands could have been added to each clip.	Excellent secondary action in the character in the head and Hands.	240 441
2	Lighting and Exposure	Did they consider and utilize lighting and value appropriately for their subject matter?	Did not take lighting into consideration	Lighting implemented incorrectly or alternative lighting should have been used.	Lighting was considered and implemented appropriately, but could use some improvement.	Lighting well executed.	112
2	Motion Timing	The motion is timed so as to ensure each scene is efficiently composed. Major poses switch in a manner that ensures shots are optimally timed.	Your timing for your scenes is inadequate, and in need of clear adjustment. You consistently fail to see poses spaced to achieve the required timing of your shots, leaving them short/long.	Your timing is fair, but there is room for improvement in the spacing of your poses throughout your shots for improved effect. This leaves some shots feeling somewhat short/long.	Your action is well spaced and timed throughout your shots. Shots consistently feel well timed in conjunction with your poses.	Your actions are very well timed for maximum impact throughout your shots. Shots consistently feel perfectly timed in conjunction with your poses.	545
2	Organization and Presentation	Is the blog well organized and presented, utilizing appropriate aesthetics such as background and textual attributes and navigational elements?	The blog is not well presented or organized.	The blog needs significant improvement to be well organized and presented, lacking significantly in aesthetics and site navigation.	The blog could be improved in regard to some organization, presentation, and aesthetic attributes.	The blog is well organized and presented, pleasing to navigate, and contains appropriate aesthetics including textual attributes and background.	373
2	Personality	Effectively performance of personality.	Incoherent performance. Poses, no clear understanding of what the character is thinking/doing.	Some actions of the character are overall still vague. Little to no thought put into motives/subtext. Some attention to silhouette but poses are difficult to read.	A clear understanding of personality could use a bit more thought into subtext. Poses are strong but need further refinement.	Convincing performance. Solid poses, movements reads well.	441
2	Poses		Few poses, no clear understanding to what the character is thinking/doing.	Some attention to silhouette but poses are difficult to read.	Poses are strong but need either refinement or more poses.	Solid poses, scene reads well.	441

2	Poses Dynamic	Characters are well posed for emotional conveyance. Characters create strong silhouettes in their dynamic positioning.	Your poses are weak, and fail to adequately convey dynamism or emotion.	Your poses do convey aspects of dynamism and emotion, but there is clear room for improvement.	You do a good job in capturing a sense of dynamism and the emotion of the character in your poses.	You have done an exceptional job in capturing a sense of dynamism and the emotion of the character in your poses.	545
2	Posing -Expression and Body Language	Does the pose make a powerful statement about attitude and personality of the subject?	No consideration to characterization of subject	Unable to effectively present characterization of subject.	Characterization was considered and implemented appropriately of subject.	Characterization of subject was well executed.	112
2	Quality	How well do your drawings read?	Drawings are difficult to understand and/or don't seem to reinforce a Story	Drawings seem to reinforce a story but show technical issues with line quality, perspective and/or value.	Drawings are clean and easy to read/understand.	Line quality, perspective and value are all evident and attended to creating a clear and easy to follow story.	110
2	Rendering	How well and skillfully were camera & rendering tools used?	Did you even pay attention in class?	Did not use production render settings. The render shows limited use or knowledge of render setting tools.	The scene shows an awareness of using rendering tools but has one error.	Rendering settings are well executed. Proper resolutions and antialiasing settings.	230 330 331
2	Source Images	Images that are effectively used in the final composition. Exposure, lighting and composition.	None of the source images are not Implemented correctly.	Exposure, lighting and composition was not well considered or executed.	Exposure, lighting and composition was considered and implemented appropriately with no or few errors.	Superior - careful attention to detail, well executed.	112
2	Staging		Composition is unattended to, minimal use of camera and/or camera is disruptive to the story.	Composition is considered with little to no camera changes and/or considerable compositional issues.	Scenes are staged and delivered in a natural and readable manner consistent with the story.	Each scene is taken into careful consideration, supporting the story artistically as well as visually.	240 441
2	Story	Does the subject matter in your image bring together a cohesive story or do they feel random and unassociated?	composition does not seem to make any effort towards maintaining a narrative.	Subject matter delivers subtle evidence of association and thus an effort towards a narrative.	A narrative is clear expressed in the selection and presentation of the subject matter.	Subject matter and composition work together in a successful union to create an image worthy of a children's book.	110 345
2	Texture	Did you research and apply appropriate textures to your objects?	No textures or textures are distracting from the objects that they surface.	Textures are missing in portions of the image or have considerable inconsistencies.	Textures reinforce all components of the image with little to no distortion.	A superior exhibition of texturing that is compliant with lighting as well as perspective.	110

2	Texturing	Did the student consider and utilize textures appropriately for scene? Color, specular, reflection, bump, normal and/or displacement.	Did not take textures into consideration or poorly executed	Textures implemented incorrectly or alternative textures should have been used.	Adequate textures were considered and implemented appropriately.	Superior - all textures well executed.	230 320 330 373
2	Timing/Spacing	Does your subject move smoothly or do frames feel choppy and/or left out making the performance difficult to read?	Timing & spacing are choppy or have blank/bad key frames unattended to. Performance is unreadable.	Timing & spacing feel smooth but with performance inconsistencies.	Timing & spacing are well thought and placed yielding a clear, readable performance.	Timing & spacing deliver a completely natural performance absorbing the viewers in the reality of the world created.	240
2	Virtual Sculpting	How skillful on applying a normal maps from using a virtual sculpting software?	No maps was applied to the character model.	Normal map was not executed appropriately. "Detail pass" was unconvincing for the character model.	Normal maps were executed. "Detail pass" was somewhat convincing for the character model.	Normal maps were executed perfectly. "Detail pass" was believable for the character model.	330 331
2	Visual Reference	Students have gathered visual reference to assist in their pose work Students have created recorded/photographed reference	You have failed to compile and utilize adequate reference to the benefit of your animation.	You have compiled an adequate amount of reference that has been utilized in parts of your animation.	You have compiled and utilized a strong body of reference within your animation work.	You have compiled and utilized an exceptional amount of reference to the clear benefit of your animations.	545
2	Visually Compelling/Composition	Are principles of composition utilized successfully to create a visually compelling image?	Did not take visual elements or principles of composition into consideration.	Utilized 1 or 2 of the principles of composition of visual elements, but not well considered or executed.	Collaboration of visual elements and principles of composition implemented but could use some improvement.	Careful implementation of collaboration of principles of composition and visual elements.	112

**Outcome #3 Demonstrate mastery of specific technical, conceptual and critical abilities within computer graphics and the mixed media. (Abilities)**

PLO	Attributes	Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
		Value	0	1	2	3	
3	Animation Principles		You have failed to display a good understanding of the 12 principles of animation within your work. There are large errors in your motion to the detriment to the scenes you have created, or your work has gone unfinished.	You have failed to display a good understanding of the 12 principles of animation within your work. There are errors in your motion that should have been remedied.	You have done a good job of demonstrating your understanding of the 12 principles of animation. You have managed the majority of errors, and have created a positive sense of urgency with the camera work.	You have done very good work in the application of the 12 principles of animation here. Errors are few, and the camera work is well done.	545

3	Appeal	Do your performance choices feel true to the motives and subtext of your subject matter? Do you use the Principles of Animation creatively to support those choices?	Incoherent performance. Subject shows little readable personality traits.	Poses show some insight into character's intent. Motives, backstory or subtext may feel unexplored.	Performance delivers a clear, consistent and readable sense of motive and thought.	A convincing as well as entertaining performance. Viewers are immersed in the mindset of the character without missing a beat.	240 441
3	Blending Images Together	Blending of visual elements together in a seamless blend.	Blending of visual elements together was not achieved.	Blending of visual elements together ineffectually achieved, allot of inconsistent errors.	Appropriately blending of visual elements together with no or few errors.	Superior - careful attention to detail, well executed.	112
3	Digital Darkroom	Did students consider and utilize the tools and techniques in Photoshop appropriately for their project.	Did not use Photoshop techniques in project.	Photoshop techniques were implemented incorrectly or only one Photoshop technique was used significantly.	Photoshop techniques were considered and implemented appropriately but could use some improvement.	Photoshop techniques were well executed. More than one Photoshop technique was demonstrated.	112
3	Edge Loops	Edge loops and flow zones were distributed across the character body and head correctly.	Did not implement edge loops and flow zones across the character model correctly. Lack of detail.	Lacking of detail, from a result of incorrectly placing edge loops and flow zones.	Appropriately applied edge loops and flow zones across the model except for one or two instances.	Placement of edge loops and flow zones were well thought-out and executed correctly.	331
3	Form and Proportions	Does the model present basic proportional and body volume relationships appropriately for its subject matter.	Did not take proportions & body volume into consideration. (Model looks nothing like the completed tutorial)	Collaboration of proportions & body volume implemented incorrectly. (Model barely meets the same proportions & volume as the tutorial)	Collaboration of proportions & body volume implemented appropriately. (Model closely mimics the tutorial)	Superior implementation of collaboration of proportions & body volume. (Model goes beyond the tutorial and does it efficiently)	331 420
3	Lighting		Lighting is completely inaccurate and/or inconsistent with the scene.	Lighting is accomplished with considerable inaccuracies and/or lacking shadows.	Lighting and shading is clear and natural with little to no inconsistencies.	A bold use of lighting that reinforces the mood, dynamic and focal point of the image.	230 320 330 331 350 420
3	Low-Poly Modeling	Did students provide enough detail to show overall form, from the original high poly model with good topology.	Too many errors in topology flow and form the original high poly model. Did you even pay attention in class? Overall models are too simplified, needed to add more detail to the models.	Errors in topology flow and doesn't provide enough detail to show overall form. Broken edges, didn't delete unwanted vertexes. Used too many triangles and/or ngons.	Appropriately modeled in quads and triangles with a few errors in topology flow and overall form. Had a few ngons on the models.	Well considered topology flow - modeled in quads and triangles perfectly. Provided enough detail to show overall form, from the original high poly model.	330

3	Map Baking	How well and skillfully was map Baking tools used? Creating a Mesh ID, normal, AO, curvature, and position maps.	No mapping skills are evident on the 3D object.	Missing maps. Or maps appear to have been constructed with lots of errors from the UVs.	The maps are well executed and appropriate for objects with a few errors or a missing map.	The maps are exceedingly well created and functional for the all the 3D objects.	330
3	Merging Images	Merging images together in a seamless blend	Did not use layer masks.	Implemented layer masks inappropriately	Used layer masks appropriately with no or few errors.	Superior - careful attention to detail, layer masks well executed.	112
3	Modeling & Overall Geometry	How well and skillfully was the modeling tools and geometry used in the scene?	Basic modeling skills were not evident in the scene.	Models appear to have been inefficiently constructed with inadequate geometry	The models are well executed with the proper amount of geometry.	The models are efficiently constructed and appropriate for the scene.	230 373
3	Overall Geometry	Did students model in quads and used edge loops efficiently?	Did not appropriately model in quads (only 80% of the model is in quads) and used edge loops incorrectly.	Appropriately model in quads (only 90% of the model is in quads) and/or used edge loops insignificantly.	Appropriately modeled in quads (95 to 99% of the model is in quads) and used edge loops efficiently.	Well considered and well executed - modeled in quads (100% of the model is in quads) and used edge loops perfectly.	331
3	Overall Geometry	Did students model in quads and used edge loops efficiently?	Did not appropriately model in quads (only 80% of the model is in quads) and used edge loops incorrectly.	Appropriately model in quads (only 90% of the model is in quads) and/or used edge loops insignificantly.	Appropriately modeled in quads (95 to 99% of the model is in quads) and used edge loops efficiently.	Well considered and well executed - modeled in quads (100% of the model is in quads) and used edge loops perfectly.	350 420
3	Polygon Limit	Is the character and accessories models over or under the polygon limit that was set for the assignment?	0	over the limit	under the limit	within polygon limit	330 331 350 420
3	Polypainting	Student did not use the Arnold render scene.	Student did not use the Arnold render scene.	Shaders and render scene not appropriately setup for use with Arnold.	Rendered in Arnold, however, the scene could use some improvement.	Rendered using Arnold properly with multiple views and made use of DOF.	331
3	Principles of Animation	Are the principles of animation utilized effectively to further the readability and style of the performance.	Subject matter shows no integration of the Principles of Animation to help support the performance.	Principles of Animation are utilized but with considerable errors in timing or execution.	Principles of Animation are integrated effectively with little errors.	Principles of Animation are woven seamlessly into the project creating a captivating performance.	240 340 441
3	Project Guidelines	Were the rules of the assignment followed correctly, culminating in a final product demonstrating discussed compositional guidelines?	Did not follow the rules of the assignment.	Implemented the rules of the assignment poorly or incorrectly.	The rules of the assignment were followed correctly, but final product could use some improvement.	The rules of the assignment were followed correctly, culminating in a final product that was well executed and demonstrating discussed compositional guidelines.	112



3	Scene Interaction	Does the Unity scene contain a first person controller to navigate within the scene?	The scene lacks a first person controller.	A first person controller is present but is positioned incorrectly: such as intersecting the ground plane	A first person controller is present but contains some attributes that are distracting such as: movement, sound, bounce, etc...	The scene contains a first person controller to navigate the scene.	230 373
3	Shader Networks	Did the student consider and utilize shader networks appropriately for the scene?	Did not take shaders into consideration or poorly executed. Alternative shaders should have been used; (Blinn instead of Imabert).	Too many errors implemented incorrectly, alternative shaders should have been used.	Shader networks implemented appropriately with few errors. It is nice and works well, but is very common.	Shader networks implemented and well executed. The shaders networks applied enhanced the scene quality.	330 331 420
3	Storyboard Language	Action is properly described along with appropriate scene and shot numbers for each panel.	Content for action and/or scene and shot numbers for panels was insufficient.	Lacking most content for action and/or scene and shot numbers for panels.	Lacking some content for action and/or some scene and shot numbers for each panel.	Content for action was properly described along with appropriate scene and shot numbers for each panel.	345
3	Texture Creation and Baking	Were the requested maps baked with minimal errors?	Several of the maps were missing.	One of the maps was missing.	The requested maps were created but some contained several errors.	The requested maps were baked with minimal errors.	373
3	Textures	Did the student consider and utilize textures appropriately for the scene? Color, specular, reflection, and bump/normal.	Did not take textures into consideration or poorly executed. Only used simple shaders for texturing.	Textures implemented incorrectly or alternative textures should have been used. Used too many simple shaders for texturing.	Adequate textures were considered and implemented. Missing a few key textures (color, spec, and bump maps) on main objects and only used simple shaders for texturing on a few objects.	All textures are applied to the objects to the scene appropriately. Used color, spec, and bump maps.	331
3	Textures Maps	Did the student consider and utilize textures appropriately for the scene? Color, specular, reflection, bump, normal and/or displacement.	Did not take texture maps into consideration or poorly executed. Textures has little creative energy; it does not have any unique or creative aspects.	Missing textures in several places or errors, textures implemented incorrectly or alternative textures should have been used. Tried to be creative but does not work and does not stand out from the crowd.	Adequate textures were considered and implemented appropriately. Textures look nice and works well, but is not unique; it has a similar look-and-feel that works well, but may not stand out from the crowd.	Diffuse, Spec, Bump/Normal, and displacement map executed correctly with excellent attention to detail.	350 420
3	Translation		Images have no resemblance to tutorial.	Composition is attended to but brushing is inaccurate or lacks texture.	Image is a definite visual resemblance of source material with little to no errors.	Image not only matches the source but exceeds its overall execution.	110

3	Uniform Spaced Geometry	Used uniform spaced geometry correctly. Geometry was spaced and evenly distributed across the character model.	Did not take uniform spaced geometry into consideration or poorly executed across the model.	Incorrect placement of uniform spaced geometry in certain parts of the model.	Geometry was well spaced and evenly distributed except for one instance or area.	Geometry was well spaced and evenly distributed	331
3	Use of Topology	How skillfully was the topology (edge flow) of the 3d model constructed?	Basic modeling skills were not evident in the scene.	Models appear to have been inefficiently constructed with inadequate topology.	The models are constructed well but contains a few errors in topology.	The models are well executed with great topology (edge flow).	331
3	UV Mapping	How well and skillfully was UV tools used?	No UV mapping skills are evident in the in the scene.	UV maps appear to have been constructed with lots of errors on many objects. Too much overlapping UV's. UVs are not scaled properly to use the 0 to 1 space efficiently.	The UV maps are well executed and appropriate for objects with errors on a few objects. Overlapping UV's or UVs not scaled properly to use the 0 to 1 space efficiently.	The UV maps are exceedingly well created and functional for the all the objects in the scene.	230 320 331 350 373 420
<b>Outcome #4</b>		<b>Demonstrate proficiency with industrial applications to visual communication related technologies. (Proficiency)</b>					
Attributes		Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
		Value	0	1	2	3	
4	Narrative Conveyance		You have failed to convey any sense of a cohesive narrative in your work, with animation that has little to no sense of urgency and emotion.	You have failed to maintain a positive adherence to the script and storyboards in your animation, and have not advanced them through the medium of 3d animation. There is also no notable sense of emotion within your work.	You have for the most part maintained a positive connection between your work and the original source material. You have a solid sense of narrative conveyance, and the emotion of the scene is also present.	You have done very good work in achieving the narrative goals of the original source material. Emotion and urgency are well presented within your animation here, and the narrative of the storyboards have been not only translated, but enhanced within the 3d medium.	545
4	Storytelling	Was the story effectively told in the narrative/story.	No broad entertainment value.	Several confusing parts; plot is unclear; communication of story lacks focus or energy.	Some mistakes in plot line but mistakes are minor; some parts of the story lack focus.	The storyline of the product is interesting and entertaining; plot is communicated effectively; all elements of story are present.	112

4	Unity Scene Construction & Interaction	Are the models arranged in Unity to demonstrate a communicated meaning and composition and contain a first or third person controller to navigate within the scene?	Scene is severely lacking in composition, does not support the game concept and lacks a character controller.	Scene composition minimally communicates a story and a likeness to the game concept and contains several inconsistencies/errors along with no character controller.	Scene composition communicates a story and a likeness to the game concept with a few inconsistencies/errors and/or a character controller is not placed properly in the scene.	Scene composition communicates a story and a likeness to the game concept and contains an appropriate character controller to navigate the scene.	373
4	UV Layout, Organization, and Atlasing	How well and skillfully were UV tools used to create efficient layouts for a game environment?	Minimal to no UV mapping skills are evident in the scene.	UV maps are constructed with several errors such as, incorrect scale or outside or significant inefficient use of 0 to 1 space, minimal atlasing demonstrated.	The UV maps are mostly well created with some errors such as, improper scale, outside and/or efficient use of 0 to 1 space, missing some atlasing.	The UV maps are well created, functional for assets, arranged to efficiently use UV space, maintain provided map size(s) and atlasing guidelines, possibly containing a few negligible errors.	373
4	Visual Continuity	Do the shots chosen for the storyboard panels provide for continuity within the story?	Shots chosen do not provide for continuity within the story.	The storyboard is incomplete and/or continuity was minimal, losing the flow of the story significantly.	Continuity was lacking in the storyboard panels, somewhat disturbing the flow of the story.	Shots chosen for the storyboard panels provide for continuity, the story flowing logically.	345
4	Visually Communicates Story	Did the final sketched shots effectively visually communicate the story?	Sketches are ineffective in communicating the story effectively.	Sketches need significant improvement to effectively communicate story such as facial expressions, clarity of content, and familiar visual cues.	Sketches need some improvement to effectively communicate story such as facial expressions, clarity of content, and familiar visual cues.	Sketches are conveyed in such a manner as to clearly communicate story visually and emotionally.	345
4	Visually Compelling	Does the image work overall? Choices of principles of composition used to create the image.	Did not take visual elements or principles of composition into consideration.	Utilized 1 or 2 of the principles of composition or visual elements, but not well considered or executed.	Collaboration of visual elements and principles of composition implemented appropriately with no or few errors.	Superior implementation of collaboration of principles of composition and visual elements.	112

**Outcome #5 Communicate effectively in written format on research and creative issues. (Written)**

	Attributes	Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
		Value	0	1	2	3	
5	Analysis quality	Was a clear and well understood analysis presented?	The assignment was minimally completed.	The analysis was minimal in ideas and support, demonstrating a lack of understanding of the material.	A more detailed and intuitive analysis should have been provided to demonstrate more understanding of the material.	A detailed and intuitive analysis was provided.	345

5	Beat Sheet	Does the beat sheet accurately portray the structure of the story and effectively communicate the story?	Beats are not appropriate for the story and the story does not go anywhere and/or the beat sheet is not included in the document.	Several beats are not appropriate for the story and/or missing too many beats. Needs significant improvement to propelling the story forward and keeping reader interest.	Most beats are appropriate but could use some improvement in propelling the story forward and keeping reader interest.	The beats provided are appropriate for the story and propel the story forward while keeping reader interest.	345
5	Blog Content	Did the blog contain visuals and detailed commentary per assignment instructions?	No content.	Inadequate detail and description of the assignment and/or missing more than one component of the blog assignment.	Adequate visual, detail, and description of assignment but lacking detail and insight and/or missing a component of the blog assignment.	Contained visuals and textual content, providing great detail and description about the project, per the assignment instructions.	345
5	Content quantity	Was the quantity of content required by the assignment present and creatively expressed?	The quantity of the analysis fell short of assignment instructions.	The quantity of content fell somewhat short of assignment instructions.	The quantity of content required by the assignment was present but could use some improvement.	The quantity of content required by the assignment was present and creatively expressed.	345
5	Formatting & Grammar	Were correct formatting and grammar demonstrated throughout the story?	Formatting/grammar errors were predominant and unacceptable.	Formatting/grammar errors are significant and distracting to the flow of the analysis.	Multiple formatting/grammar that begin to disturb the flow of the analysis.	No or negligible formatting/grammar errors	345
5	Formatting, Grammar & Spelling	Was the document formatted and content organized according to assignment instructions with careful attention to grammar and spelling?	The assignment was formatted incorrectly and/or with several grammar and spelling errors.	The document contained several formatting and/or grammar & spelling errors, making it difficult to ascertain if the correct information was provided.	The content provided contained some formatting and/or grammar & spelling errors.	The document was formatted exactly to assignment instructions, including attention to grammar & spelling, making it easy to navigate through the content.	345
5	Reflective Commentary/Analysis	Is information/analysis well written and supported with appropriate visuals? Are all observations representative of critical thinking and provide practical suggestions for future learning and improvement?	Significant information is missing or incomplete and observations/commentary do not reflect critical thinking or provide practical suggestions for future learning and improvement.	Information is missing or incomplete and observations/commentary minimally reflect critical thinking or provide practical suggestions for future learning and improvement.	Most of the observations/commentary represent growth and include goals for continued learning, needing minimal improvement.	Observation/analysis is well written and supported with appropriately related visuals. All commentary is representative of critical thinking and provides for practical suggestions for future learning and improvement.	112 230 320 373

5	Story Development	Does the story depicted in the script follow a story structure that provides for an introduction, rising action, and conclusion?	The story does not provide for an appropriate introduction, rising action, and conclusion. The story is not effectively communicated to the audience.	The story minimally provides for an appropriate introduction, rising action, and conclusion. Needs significant improvement to communicate the story effectively to the audience.	The story mostly provides for an appropriate introduction, rising action, and conclusion, but needs some improvement to communicate the story effectively to the audience.	The story provides for an appropriate introduction, rising action, and conclusion.	345
5	Title, Genre, Logline	Were the title, logline, and genre provided for the chosen film?	Title, logline, and genre not provided.	One or more of the requested components are missing.	The title, logline, and genre are present but some components are not appropriate to the title and/or one of these components is not provided.	The title, logline, and genre are present and appropriate for the title.	345
5	Write-up	Description of project - triumphs and pitfalls of the project	No paper.	Poorly written with errors and less than a page.	Written with no or few errors and less than a page.	Written effectively and full length of page.	112 331
5	Writing Conventions: Formatting, Grammar, and Spelling	Are writing conventions appropriately expressed: sentence construction, grammar, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling?	There are several errors in writing conventions: sentence construction, grammar, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling requiring major editing and revision.	There are many errors in writing conventions: sentence construction, grammar, spelling & punctuation, and ineffective word choice.	The text has some negligible errors in regard to writing conventions.	No or few errors in sentence construction, grammar, capitalization, punctuation, or spelling	112 230 320 373

**Outcome #6 Communicate effectively in oral format on research and creative issues. (Oral)**

	Attributes	Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
		Value	0	1	2	3	
6	Body language		Immobile, hands in pockets, or blocked screen	Did not always indicate how material on the screen was related to presentation	Consistently used gestures to coordinate oral and visual presentation	Excellent use gestures to provide emphasis	230
6	Hesitations, other voice habits		Presentation full of hesitations, ums, ahs, etc.	Some hesitations, ums, ahs, etc.	Clear, continuous presentation, perhaps a few ums, ahs, etc.	Superior presentation, free of ums, ahs, etc.	320
6	Maintaining eye contact		No eye contact with audience at all	Poor eye contact, looking down or at screen significant portion of time	Maintained eye contact other than quick glances at screen	Maintained eye contact with all segments of the audience	230 320
6	Poise		Clearly unsure, nervous, confused	At times appears unsure nervous, confused	Composed at all times	Exudes/convey confidence	230 320

6	Voice volume, enunciation & speed	How well spoken the presentation was executed?	Unintelligible.	Voice hard to hear, words slurred or voice trails off, spoke too slow or too fast, monotone with little emphasis.	Voice clearly heard, words clearly enunciated, did not speak too slowly or too rapidly	Voice projected very well, clear enunciation, did not speak too slowly or rapidly	320 345
---	-----------------------------------	------------------------------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------

**Outcome #7 Apply critical thinking and aesthetic judgments in critiquing mixed media and computer graphics productions. (Critiquing)**

	Attributes	Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
		Value	0	1	2	3	
7	Commentary	Did the student meet the requirements for the critique responses?	Most if not all of the critique responses were either missing or inadequate.	Several of the critique responses were lacking in detail and insight, falling short of requirements.	Detailed and insightful commentary on most critique but lacking in a few responses.	Detailed and insightful commentary on all critiques per assignment instructions.	345
7	Critical Thinking - Composition, Content, and Aesthetics	Was the scene considered and constructed to convey meaning and utilize an effective combination of aesthetic elements and creativity?	The scene shows little evidence of thought regarding content and camera movement.	The scene accomplishes the assignment adequately, yet shows a lack of planning and little evidence that an overall composition was thought out and executed. Tried to be creative but does not work; it has a look and feel that is very common and does not stand out from the crowd.	The content and camera movement of the scene is meaningful. It is nice and works well, but is not unique; The scene shows application of the composition but lacking elements that would make it stand out from the rest.	The content and camera movement of the scene is meaningful and stands above the rest. The scene shows an awareness of composition and an effective color scheme. It uses a unique approach that truly enhances the project; it shows creativity that works, it is exciting, fresh and intriguing.	320

**Outcome #9 Work collaboratively and individually with an understanding of the production process utilized in industry-standard studios. (Process)**

	Attributes	Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
		Value	0	1	2	3	
9	Camera & Rendering	How well and skillfully was camera, lighting effects, & rendering tools used?	The render shows no or limited use or knowledge of tools. The scene appears to be thrown together.	Basic skills are evident from the render including some anti-aliasing, and lighting and camera effects.	Tools were used well to produce a quality render of the scene, including appropriate anti-aliasing, and lighting and camera effects.	Tools were used flawlessly to produce a superior render of the scene with clear planning and skillful use of all appropriate tools.	350 420 493
9	Camera, Lighting, & Rendering	Was the scene considered and constructed to convey meaning and utilize an effective combination of aesthetic lighting and rendering?	The scene shows little evidence of thought, regarding content and the elements and principles of lighting & rendering.	The scene falls short of the assignment, shows a lack of planning and little evidence of overall aesthetics.	Lighting was considered and implemented appropriately but lacking elements that would make it stand out from the rest.	The scene shows an awareness of an effective lighting.	331

9	Critique Completion	Did the student complete and respond to all submissions?	No completed critiques.	Didn't complete several of the critiques.	Didn't complete some of the critiques.	Completed all critiques for student submissions.	345
9	File Structure	Implementation of file naming conventions & directory formats.	Did not follow file naming conventions in any form.	More than one file naming convention & directory format was incorrectly implemented.	At least one file naming convention & directory format was incorrectly implemented.	All file naming conventions & directory format were followed correctly.	112
9	File Structure & Formats	Did Students follow instructions in saving their project, substances and images?	Did not follow instructions for naming conventions and/or file structure.	Partially followed instructions: file structure, naming, and working files.	Followed instructions and file structure with a few errors.	Instructions and file structure implemented perfectly: file structure, naming, and working files.	373
9	File Structure & Layer Organization	Implementation of file naming & file structure. Naming layers properly.	Both file naming & structure and naming layers was implemented incorrectly.	Implemented 1 of the file naming & structures or naming layers properly was followed with errors.	One or both file naming & structure and naming layers was correctly followed with few errors.	Both file naming & structure and naming layers was correctly followed.	112
9	File Structure and Formats	Did Students follow instructions (setting project, all required folders and files in their proper locations, and naming conventions) in saving their project and images?	Did not follow instructions or file structure.	Significant errors in file structure and format: file structure, naming, and working files.	Followed instructions and file structure with a few errors: improper naming, missing files/folders, no MEL script file.	Instructions and file structure implemented perfectly: file structure, naming, and working files.	230 320
9	File Structures and Formats	Did students follow instructions in saving their project and images.	Did not follow instructions or file structure. Only one working file.	Partially followed instructions and file structure. Partially working files.	Partially followed instructions file and structure. All work files work appropriately.	Instructions and file structure implemented appropriately. All work files work appropriately.	330 331 350 420 493
9	File Submission	Did you turn in the requested type of file in the right place and were the compression settings and file name correct?	File submitted in incorrect format or in incorrect folder.	File submitted in correct format and location but with incorrect compression settings.	File submitted correctly but with incorrect filename.	File submitted with all the desired settings accounted to.	110 240
9	Model Export and Import	Were the models exported from Maya in the proper format and successfully imported into Unity?	Models insufficiently exported from Maya and/or imported in Unity incorrectly and/or insufficient to no shader/texture application and no colliders.	Models exported from Maya and imported into Unity with several errors such as file type, scale, texture/shader application, and/or no colliders applied.	Models exported from Maya with some errors such as incorrect file format, scale, and imported into Unity with minimal errors with shader and texture application in Unity scene and/or some colliders are not applied.	Models exported from Maya in correct scale (cm) and file format and correctly imported into Unity along with correct shader and texture application in Unity scene, and colliders are applied to each model with few errors if any.	230

9	Quality of Work	Does the work achieve a level of integrity parallel to industry standards?	Quality of work is subpar or that of a beginning level class.	Work is readable but is evident that more practice is necessary.	Work shows evidence of growth, understanding and development.	Work displays symptoms and/or characteristics synonymous with industry standards.	420 493
9	Scene and Shot Numbers	Were scene and shot numbers correctly communicated on each shot panel?	No scene or shot numbers are present on storyboard.	Some scene and/or shot numbers are missing on the storyboard.	Scene and shot numbers are present but incorrectly assigned and represented.	Scene and shot numbers are appropriately indicated on each panel. They are properly assigned to represent consecutive movement across panels and/or changes in time or location.	345
9	Scene Organization	Was the scene organized properly in the Outliner and Attribute Editor including naming and grouping of models and materials/textures ?	Little to no scene organization implemented and/or missing several required models for the scene.	Minimal scene organization implemented: Didn't name several objects and/or materials/textures. Didn't group enough objects to produce a cleaner scene. Missing more than one model in scene.	Most scene organization elements implemented: Didn't name some objects and/or materials/textures. Could've grouped more objects to produce a cleaner scene. Missing a required a model for the scene.	All scene organization elements implemented: Named all objects and/or materials/textures. Grouped all necessary objects to produce a cleaner scene, all required models in scene.	230 320 330 331 350 373
9	Script Execution and Formatting	Were the proper script formatting rules applied for a silent film?	The script does not follow the proper formatting requirements.	The script has several errors, needing significant improvement in script formatting.	The script is well written, needing minimal improvement in script formatting.	The script is well written following all of the rules and formatting for a script.	345
9	Task Management	Is a solid workflow evident? Does the assignment feel complete with sufficient time devoted to its execution?	Project is clearly incomplete.	Work is evident but piece still clearly needs more time for completion.	Successful workflow is apparent. Project feels complete but refinements could still be made.	Assignment looks like a completely finalized piece. All the I's are dotted and T's are crossed.	110 240
9	Unity Importation	Was the model properly imported into Unity and the textures applied correctly?	The model was not imported into Unity.	The model was imported into Unity where many errors or missing textures were evident.	The model was appropriately exported from Maya and imported into Unity where the textures were applied but some errors were evident.	The model was appropriately exported from Maya and imported into Unity where the textures were correctly applied.	373
9	Web Gallery	Implementation & organization of website gallery.	Did not have website gallery.	Several components to the website gallery format were implemented incorrectly.	One website gallery format element was implemented incorrectly.	Website gallery format was followed correctly.	112

**Outcome #10 Demonstrate professionalism through creative and intellectual independence. (Professionalism)**

Attributes	Description	Unacceptable	Marginal	Acceptable	Exceptional	Course
------------	-------------	--------------	----------	------------	-------------	--------



	Value	0	1	2	3		
10	Compilation	Students have created block out playblast renders of their individual shots. Students have compiled their individual renders in a single video. Student teams have collectively compiled their individual rough animation renders	You have failed to ensure your playblast videos were correctly rendered and compiled for upload.	You have ensured your playblast videos were correctly rendered and compiled for upload, but there is room for improvement in your editing and rendering.	You have ensured your video was correctly compiled and uploaded. There is room for minor improvement in your editing and rendering.	You have ensured work was rendered, compiled, and presented to a high standard.	545
10	Content - Professional	Does the amount of content justify the amount of time allocated?	Very little work exhibited compared to the amount of time allocated.	Amount of work seems acceptable but with an excessive amount of unfinished projects.	A solid bulk of finished work with minimal unfinished pieces.	It is evident that time was spent above and beyond that allocated to create an impressive amount of finished pieces.	493
10	Organization - Professional	Is your content organized and easy to sift through for a recruiter? Does it quickly display your trade, reel and intent?	Blog is difficult to navigate. Content is sporadic with no reasonable chronology.	Blog exhibits a basic structure but seems to jump around.	The blog is well organized and easy to navigate.	The blog gives the immediate impression of who you are, what you do, and makes your reel readily available in the beginning.	493
10	Professionalism - Blog Post	Did the blog post exhibit a professional appearance and contain professional content?	The blog post contained content irrelevant to research and problem-solving, exhibiting a high level of unprofessionalism.	The blog post was quite lacking in professionalism, containing a large amount of textual content that did not exhibit research and problem-solving efforts.	The blog post was mostly professional, but contained some textual content that did not exhibit research and problem-solving efforts.	The blog post was professional, containing images indicative of progress and textual explanation of possible problems encountered and appropriate solutions.	373
10	Professionalism - ePortfolio	Is content appropriate for the intended audience and does it relate to the purpose of the assignment?	Content is inconsistent and unsuitable for the intended audience, containing unorganized, unrelated, and inappropriate elements.	Content contains many unprofessional elements, unrelated to the purpose of the eportfolio, that are unorganized, unclear, and somewhat unprofessional.	Most content is professional and appropriately related to the purpose of the ePortfolio. A few elements are unorganized or unrelated.	Content is relevant, well-thought out, professionally executed, and suitable for an academic as well as a wider audience.	112 230 320
10	Slideshow	Did the slideshow contain all of the required information for the presentation?	Unacceptable slideshow presentation. Did not follow assignment instructions.	Slideshow contains minimal information and minimally follows assignment instructions.	Slideshow contains most required information.	Slideshow contains all required information as detailed in the assignment instructions.	230

10	Slideshow	Did the slideshow contain all of the required information for the presentation?	Unacceptable slideshow presentation. Did not follow assignment instructions.	Slideshow contains minimal information and minimally follows assignment instructions.	Slideshow contains most required information.	Slideshow contains all required information as detailed in the assignment instructions.	320
10	Usability and Accessibility: Site Navigation, Text Elements, Layout, and Color	Is the ePortfolio intuitively organized and the post pleasing to read? Blocks of text and bullet points utilized, font style and type size vary appropriately, text and color palette are suitable and aesthetically pleasing.	The ePortfolio post is overall difficult to read due to inappropriate use of font styles, type size, textual organization, and color palette.	The ePortfolio needs much improvement: unorganized posts, mostly difficult to read due to inappropriate use of font style, type size, long paragraphs, color palette.	The ePortfolio needs some improvement such as: site navigation, use of font style and type size, color palette.	The ePortfolio is intuitively organized and the post is pleasing to read: blocks of text and bullet points utilized, font style and type size vary appropriately, text and color palette are suitable and aesthetically pleasing.	112 230 320
10	Visual Communication	Were all of the required visual elements present and did they work together to create a clear and compelling description that would attract the interest of the audience?	The post was significantly lacking in the required visual elements and/or severely lacked in supporting the clarity of and effectively communicating the project to the audience.	Many of the required visual elements were not present and/or lacked significantly in supporting the clarity of and effectively communicating the project to the audience.	Some of the required visual elements were not present and/or lacked in supporting the clarity of and effectively communicating the project to the audience.	All of the required visual elements were present and supported the communication objective adding to the clarity of and effectively communicating to, the audience.	112 230 320 373
10	Work Ethic	showed a level of work consistency each week throughout the semester.	Cannot have a consistent pace of work each week throughout the semester	Constantly faltering with levels of work each week.	Show the level of consistency each week with a few times faltering.	Showed a level of consistency throughout the semester.	493